Measuring neutrino mass with radioactive ions in a storage ring

Christopher Orme IPPP, Durham University

Nufact 09,

IIT, Chicago, 20st - 25th July 2009

Work in collaboration with Mats Lindroos, Bob McElrath and Thomas Schwetz based on arXiv:0904.1809

< ロ > < 同 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ >



- The idea
- Strategy and simulations
- Summary and outlook

2

ヘロト 人間 とくほとくほとう

THE PROBLEM OF NEUTRINO MASS

Discovery of neutrino oscillations implies neutrinos have mass, but its presence is a very small effect.

Δm^2_{21} $ \Delta m^2_{23} $	7.6 \cdot 10 ⁻⁵ eV ² 2.4 \cdot 10 ⁻³ eV ²	SNO, KamLAND SK, K2K, MINOS	mass scale from oscillations.
			• Cosmology and $0\nu\beta\beta$
	< 2.3 eV	Mainz, Troitsk	are model dependent
m _v	0.2 - 2.3 eV ?	KATRIN, MARE-II	approaches.
	< 0.2 ?	?	Need direct searches

T. Schwetz, M. Tortola and J. W. F. Valle, New J. Phys. 10 (2008) 113011

No access to neutrino

< □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □

C. Kraus et al., Eur. Phys. J. C 40, 447 (2005); V. M. Lobashev et al., Nucl. Phys. Proc. Suppl. 91 (2001) 280. A. Osipowicz et al. [KATRIN Coll.], arXiv:hep-ex/0109033

ELECTRON SPECTRUM

The electron spectrum in beta decay is the incoherent sum over the spectra of the mass eigenstates

$$\frac{d\Gamma}{dE_{\beta}} = \sum_{i} |U_{ei}|^2 \frac{d\Gamma_i}{dE_{\beta}}$$

where

$$\frac{d\Gamma_i}{dE_{\beta}} = \rho_{\beta}E_{\beta}(E_0 - E_{\beta})\sqrt{(E_0 - E_{\beta})^2 - m_i^2} F(Z, E_{\beta})S(E_{\beta})\Theta(E_0 - E - m_i)$$

For poor energy resolution, we may introduce the effective neutrino mass

$$m_{\rm eff} = \sqrt{\sum_i |U_{\rm ei}|^2 m_i^2}$$

This 'textbook' spectrum has been compared with more accurate expressions.

F. Vissani, Nucl. Phys. Proc. Suppl. 100 (2001) 273

◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆臣▶ ◆臣▶ ─ 臣 ─ のへで

S. Gardner, V. Bernard and U. G. Meissner, Phys. Lett. B 598, 188 (2004)

S. S. Masood, S. Nasri, J. Schechter, M. A. Tortola, J. W. F. Valle and C. Weinheimer, Phys. Rev. C 76, 045501 (2007)

EFFECTIVE MASS BEHAVIOUR

The sign of Δm_{23}^2 is presently unknown. The ordering of the mass eigenstates impacts the behaviour of the effective mass.



Long term target for end point studies is $m_{eff} < 0.04$ eV and, ultimately, the resolution of individual mass eigenstates.

S. M. Bilenky, M. D. Mateev and S. T. Petcov, Phys. Lett. B 639, 312 (2006)

(日) (四) (三) (三) (三)

We are searching for and would like to measure a very small kinematic effect.

Specifically, to achieve a measurable and useful event rate requires



We need

- A high source rate
- Control of backgrounds

< □ ▶ < / □ ▶

High precision

Innovative technology and/or experimental guile is needed if $m_V < 0.2 eV$.

THE IDEA

Ξ.

ヘロト 人間 とく ヨト く ヨト

Advancements in technology allow for the control of low boost ions with extremely high precision.



2

ヘロト 人間 とくほ とくほとう

Not many electrons close to the endpoint will travel in the backward direction →
 we are considering a slice of momentum rather than a sphere.

$$N(p_{\min}, p_{\max}) = \frac{1}{2} \iint_{\mathcal{S}} \frac{d\Gamma}{dE} \frac{p_{\perp}}{pE} dp_{\perp} dp_{\parallel}$$

where S is the region:

$$p_{\max} - \varepsilon < p_{\parallel} < p_{\max}$$

and

$$0 < p_{\perp} < \sqrt{p_{\max}^2 - p_{\parallel}}$$



 $\equiv \rightarrow$

Q values are not known very well; for example, ¹⁰⁶ Ru has $Q = 39.40 \pm 0.21$ keV. In this work we have employed the following strategy

- Run with a small ε, selecting electrons very close to the endpoint travelling in the backward direction.
- **2** Run with large ε to constrain the Q-value.

To extract the neutrino mass it is necessary to perform (at least) a two-parameter fit to the 'data', unless Q can be determined externally.

イロト 不得 トイヨト イヨト 三日

RESULTS

æ

▲ロト ▲御ト ▲ 陸ト ▲ 陸ト

- Q = 5 keV
- Nature 'chosen' $m_v = 0.1 \text{ eV}$
- Useful decays, $N_{\rm dec} = 10^{18}$



A B > A B > A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A

프 🖌 🛪 프 🕨

DISCOVERY POTENTIAL



- Spectral information can be obtained through examination of the radial distribution of events.
- There is significant averaging, however
 - \rightarrow very little gain.

A B > A B > A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A

SYSTEMATICS AND BACKGROUND



If ions with Q-values O(1) keV are available then classical cooling techniques can be used. For larger Q-values, new techniques will be required.

$$\delta E_{\beta} = 2E_{\beta} \frac{\delta p_{l}}{p_{l}} + O\left[\left(\frac{E_{\beta}}{m_{e}}\right)^{2}\right]$$

For cooled low intensity ion beams of 5000-10000 ions, a transition to much lower momentum spread has been observed with increasing cooling current at NAP-M in Novosibirsk , ESR at GSI and CRYRING at MSL.

V. V. Parkhomchuk, in Proceedings of ECOOL 1984, edited by H. Poth (KfK 3846, Karlsruhe, 1984), p. 71; N. S. Dikansky and D.V. Pestrikov, ibid., p. 275; M. Steck et al., Phys. Rev. Lett. 77, 3803 (1996); H. Danared, A. Kallberg, K.-G. Rensfelt, and A. Simonsson, Phys. Rev. Lett. 88, 174801 (2002).

・ロト ・ 一下・ ・ ヨト ・ ヨト

This analysis indicates $10^{18} - 10^{20}$ ions will be needed. This is in line with projected EURISOL production rates. However

- Ions will be long lived
- Ions will possibly have large proton number

Storage of ions will be a problem - c.f. beta beams require low Z and half-lives ~ 1 second to source 10^{18} useful neutrinos each year.

In addition, space charge effects are largest at non-relativistic velocities.

J. Cornell, Caen GANIL - (03/12, rec. Mar. 04) 1 CD, 622 p.

http://www.eurisol.org; H. L. Ravn et al., Nucl. Instrum. Meth. B 88 (1994) 441.

C. Volpe, J. Phys. G 30 (2004) L1.

◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆三▶ ◆三▶ ● ● ●

- Measuring the neutrino mass is hard. Innovative technology and/or experimental guile will be required if below KATRIN limit.
- Technological advances in crystalised ion beams have opened possibility of measuring beta decay kinematics with sub-eV precision*.
- Low Q and a high number of useful decays are necessary to match the KATRIN limit in a counting experiment of this type.
- More complicated and creative strategies are required to exploit low energy radioactive beams in this way.

◆□> ◆檀> ◆酒> ◆酒> 三酒